

CFMS Position Paper on Responding to Medical Student Suicide

Emily Yung, McGill University
François Lagacé, McGill University
You Jia Zhong, McGill University
Vanessa Tabry, McGill University
Bianca Sarkis, McGill University
Lysanne Sun-Drapeau, McGill University
Siwen Jin, McGill University

BACKGROUND

Medical professionals are often subject to heavy schedules, stressful encounters involving life-or-death decisions, and high expectations on behalf of the population they are treating. The Canadian Medical Association National Physician Health Survey in 2017 found that of the 3000 Canadian residents and physicians who responded, 30% reported burnout, 34% experienced symptoms of depression, and 8% had had suicidal ideations within the past 12 months (1). In addition, the prevalence of suicide disproportionately affects physicians, with rates among male and female physicians being 40% and 130% higher than in the general population, respectively (2). Such statistics are very worrisome for both practicing physicians and for medical students.

Burnout is known to have a strong dose-response relationship with suicidal ideation. Many stressors affecting medical students may contribute to such burnout, including high academic demands, harassment or discrimination, insufficient social support, exposure to patients' suffering and death, financial concerns, workload, decreased sleep, and suboptimal learning environments (3,4,5). It has been hypothesized that medical students' well-being deteriorate during medical school. Upon entering medical school, students typically demonstrate fewer symptoms of both depression and burnout compared to college graduates of the same age that are not studying medicine (3). To illustrate, a study by Brazeau et al. shows that 26.2% and 27.3% of incoming medical students demonstrate symptoms of depression and burnout, respectively, compared to 42.4% and 37.3% of age-matched college graduates pursuing careers in other fields (3). However, once medical school begins, the mental health profiles of medical students compared to those of their age-matched peers pursuing other careers are worse, exhibiting more emotional exhaustion, depersonalization, and overall burnout. As such, the drivers of burnout are thought to be rooted in the medical learning environment (4,6).

Studies by Dyrbye et al. and Rotenstein et al. have shown that, by the time of graduation, 1 in 10 medical students experience suicidal ideation, approximately one-third experience depressive symptoms, and one-half experience burnout (6,7). In addition, a survey sent out to the 17 Canadian medical schools (response rate of

94%) reported that there were six Canadian medical student suicides between 2006 and 2016; five of the six deaths occurred during senior years of study (third year, fourth year, after graduation before residency) (8). It is important to note that not all suicide attempts result in death. In fact, the prevalence of self-reported suicide attempts across 37 studies of medical students ranges from 0% to 6.4% (9).

Even with the introduction of pass-fail grading systems, wellness programs, and team-learning sessions implemented to address mental illness, the stigma associated with mental illness still remains especially difficult to overcome. This fear of stigmatization by both peers and the medical establishment has been identified as one of the barriers for medical students seeking care. As a result, medical students in distress rarely reach out. In addition, concerns over professional ramifications including negative impacts on residency applications, academic records, insurability, and medical licenses all prevent medical students from seeking help when they need it the most (10,11).

The Canadian Medical Association recognizes physician health as an important concern within the medical profession and has released a policy in 2017 that provides recommendations at all levels of the healthcare system to help promote physician health (12). Some of these recommendations include, but are not limited to, the integration of the maintenance of personal well-being as part of the CanMEDS Professional Role, the optimization of healthy and supportive learning environments, providing physicians and students with accessible mental health services, and the integration of wellness programs and formal wellness curricula at the undergraduate and postgraduate levels. Physician health has a direct impact on the quality of patient care, and these recommendations highlight the importance of addressing this issue as early as undergraduate medical training (12).

PRINCIPLES

The CFMS endorses the following principles in support of an action plan that addresses both the prevention of and the response to medical student suicide.

1. Medical student suicide is of serious concern to CFMS members, medical faculties, and others, including family and friends of medical learners, and society as a whole, given the system-wide impact of the loss of medical trainees.
2. Collaboration between CFMS, medical student societies, medical faculties, provincial medical associations, regulatory bodies, and the Canadian Medical Association is important to reduce the stigma associated with mental illness, to encourage students to seek help, and to support them when they do.
3. A coordinated postvention (support-based interventions that occur following a suicide) plan based on communication, education, and counselling should be established in medical faculties.

CONCERNS

Concern 1: Suicide risk increases as medical training progresses.

Documented suicides among Canadian medical students primarily occur later in education (third year, fourth year, and after graduation before residency) (8). In addition, the risk of burnout increases in upper years of training compared to more junior years of training (13). Possible contributors to increased suicide risk later in medical school may include but not limited to working long hours and having limited control of one's schedule, workplace mistreatment, financial burden and stress from doing electives and the Canadian Resident Matching Service (CaRMS) process, fear of being unmatched, etc.

Concern 2: Many students at risk do not seek the help they need.

Despite experiencing distress and/or burnout, medical students may not seek the help they need due to fears of privacy breaches, stigma of mental illnesses, and potential consequences on career trajectories. In fact, more than two-thirds of medical students don't seek help despite going through emotional distress (15). This trend persists among Canadian physicians from a localized cohort: 18% reported being depressed, 25% of them considered seeking help, but only 2% of them actually did (18). As well, there is a fear that when one appears unwell, it may poorly reflect upon their medical competence and suggest that the need for help is a reflection of their inability to cope (14).

Concern 3: Not all Canadian medical schools have suicide response policies.

It is critical to have a plan in the event of a student suicide. However, a recent study reported that only ten (63%) of Canadian medical undergraduate programs have policies or guidelines on the steps to take following a medical student suicide. (8)

RECOMMENDATIONS

The CFMS supports the following recommendations to Undergraduate Medical Education (UGME) across Canada:

1. Strengthen prevention and education efforts surrounding mental health
 - 1.1. Integrate teaching about mental health and mental illness in the medical curricula, including but not limited to self-awareness, self-care, resiliency, and suicidality, especially in the first and second years of medical school, to provide opportunities to reduce stigma surrounding these topics and for students to reflect on their own mental health and develop ways of coping.
 - 1.2. Promote accessible mental health resources both on-campus and off-campus and make this information readily available to students.
2. Promote early identification of students at risk
 - 2.1. Train peers to have a role in early identification of at-risk students by making training available to students (eg. Sentinel training or Applied Suicide

- Intervention Skills Training (ASIST)) to learn how to recognize both signs of distress and risk of suicide, and to refer peers to appropriate resources within their university and/or community.
- 2.2. Ensure students and faculty are made aware of appropriate resources to support medical students should a student show signs of significant psychological distress and/or disclose suicidal ideation.
3. Provide timely support
 - 3.1. Offer timely support throughout medical school and especially in clerkship when suicide risk often increases. Options of timely support not only include counselling during the day, but also evenings to accommodate for the schedule of clerks.
 - 3.2. Offer accessible forms of support for students on visiting electives (eg. online/telephone). Web-based cognitive behavioural therapy (CBT) can also be considered (16).
 4. Establish a suicide response protocol at each Canadian medical school
 - 4.1. Collaborating with students and faculty partners, faculty should establish a plan in the event of a student suicide in their population. In the event of a student death, in keeping with respect for the student and their family, sensitive communication between the school and student body is needed to provide support in a timely manner.
 - 4.2. Possible resources that can provide guidance in protocol development include: [After a Suicide: A Toolkit for Residency/Fellowship Programs](#) (19) and [After a suicide: A toolkit for schools](#) (20)
 - 4.3. The CFMS will not make public statements about any details related to any medical student death (including suicide) until permission is granted by the school and families.

REFERENCES

1. Canadian Medical Association. Physician Health and Wellness [Internet]. Ottawa: Canadian Medical Association; 2017 [cited 2018 Sept 10]. Available from <https://www.cma.ca/En/Pages/physician-health.aspx>
2. Schernhammer ES, Colditz GA. Suicide rates among physicians: a quantitative and gender assessment (meta-analysis). *The American journal of psychiatry*. 2004;161(12):2295-302.
3. Brazeau CM, Shanafelt T, Durning SJ, Massie FS, Eacker A, Moutier C, et al. Distress among matriculating medical students relative to the general population. *Academic medicine : journal of the Association of American Medical Colleges*. 2014;89(11):1520-5.

4. Dyrbye LN, Thomas MR, Massie FS, Power DV, Eacker A, Harper W, et al. Burnout and suicidal ideation among U.S. medical students. *Annals of internal medicine*. 2008;149(5):334-41.
5. Goldman ML, Shah RN, Bernstein CA. Depression and suicide among physician trainees: recommendations for a national response. *JAMA psychiatry*. 2015;72(5):411-2.
6. Dyrbye L, Shanafelt T. A narrative review on burnout experienced by medical students and residents. *Medical Education*. 2016;50(1):132-49.
7. Rotenstein LS, Ramos MA, Torre M, Segal JB, Peluso MJ, Guille C, et al. Prevalence of Depression, Depressive Symptoms, and Suicidal Ideation Among Medical Students: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Jama*. 2016;316(21):2214-36.
8. Zivanovic R, McMillan J, Lovato C, Roston C. Death by Suicide among Canadian Medical Students: A National Survey-Based Study. *Canadian journal of psychiatry Revue canadienne de psychiatrie*. 2018;63(3):178-81.
9. Coentre RM, Figueira ML. Depression and suicidal behavior in medical students: a systematic review. *Curr Psychiatry Rev*. 2015;11(2):86-101.
10. Ey S, Moffit M, Kinzie JM, Brunett PH. Feasibility of a Comprehensive Wellness and Suicide Prevention Program: A Decade of Caring for Physicians in Training and Practice. *Journal of Graduate Medical Education*. 2016;8(5):747-53.
11. Schwenk TL, Davis L, Wimsatt LA. Depression, stigma, and suicidal ideation in medical students. *Jama*. 2010;304(11):1181-90.
12. Canadian Medical Association. CMA Policy Physician Health [Internet]. Ottawa: Canadian Medical Association; 2017 [cited 2018 Sept 10]. Available from <http://policybase.cma.ca/dbtw-wpd/Polycypdf/PD18-01.pdf>
13. McLuckie A, Matheson KM, Landers AL, Landine J, Novick J, Barrett T, et al. The Relationship Between Psychological Distress and Perception of Emotional Support in Medical Students and Residents and Implications for Educational Institutions. *Academic psychiatry : the journal of the American Association of Directors of Psychiatric Residency Training and the Association for Academic Psychiatry*. 2018;42(1):41-7.
14. Wallace JE, Lemaire JB, Ghali WA. Physician wellness: a missing quality indicator. *Lancet (London, England)*. 2009;374(9702):1714-21.

15. Matheson KM, Barrett T, Landine J, McLuckie A, Soh NL, Walter G. Experiences of Psychological Distress and Sources of Stress and Support During Medical Training: a Survey of Medical Students. *Academic psychiatry : the journal of the American Association of Directors of Psychiatric Residency Training and the Association for Academic Psychiatry*. 2016;40(1):63-8.
16. Guille C, Zhao Z, Krystal J, Nichols B, Brady K, Sen S. Web-Based Cognitive Behavioral Therapy Intervention for the Prevention of Suicidal Ideation in Medical Interns: A Randomized Clinical Trial. *JAMA psychiatry*. 2015;72(12):1192-8)
17. Dyrbye LN, Thomas MR, Shanafelt TD. Systematic review of depression, anxiety, and other indicators of psychological distress among U.S. and Canadian medical students. *Academic medicine : journal of the Association of American Medical Colleges*. 2006;81(4):354-73.
18. Wallace JE, Lemaire J. On physician well being—You'll get by with a little help from your friends. *Social science and medicine*. 2007;64(12):2565-2577.
19. American Foundation for Suicide Prevention [Internet]. After a Suicide: A Toolkit for Residency/Fellowship Programs. New York: American Foundation for Suicide Prevention; 2018 [cited 2018 August 26]. Available from <https://afsp.org/our-work/education/healthcare-professional-burnout-depression-suicide-prevention/>
20. American Foundation for Suicide Prevention, & Suicide Prevention Resource Center [Internet]. After a suicide: A toolkit for schools (2nd ed.). Waltham, MA: Education Development Center 2018 [cited 2018 August 26]. Available from <https://www.sprc.org/resources-programs/after-suicide-toolkit-schools>